

Example responses plus commentaries

The following student responses are intended to illustrate how the mark scheme can be interpreted and how it is likely that students will respond to the questions, allowing the student and teacher to explore and reflect upon the mark scheme and how answers can be improved.

Specimen Paper 2A/B – Britain: power and the people

Question 01

Study Source A

How useful is Source A to a historian studying Oliver Cromwell?

[8 marks]

Mark scheme

Target	Analyse sources contemporary to the period (AO3a) Evaluate sources and make substantiated judgements (AO3b) In analysing and evaluating sources, candidates will draw on their contextual knowledge to question critically the content and provenance of the source (for example, the context of the time in which source was created, place, author's situation, knowledge, beliefs, circumstances, access to information, purpose and audience).	
Level 4:	Complex evaluation of source with sustained judgement based on content and provenance Extends Level 3. Candidates may progress from a developed evaluation of the source by sustained, balanced judgements of the source supported by factual knowledge or understanding related to the enquiry point and the broader context of the thematic study. For example, it is useful because this is how he was represented during his rule. He is presented as a military and saintly figure. He has tradition and the Bible on his side. As he's presented in a positive light, the source is useful as a piece of propaganda, showing his virtues, but we know that many of these images were destroyed after suggesting that subsequent rulers did not want his memory to be a positive one.	7-8
Level 3:	Developed evaluation of source based on content and/or provenance Extends Level 2. Candidates may progress from a simple evaluation of the source with extended reasoning supported by factual knowledge and understanding related to the enquiry point and the broader context of the thematic. This may evaluate utility either on the basis of content or provenance. For example, it is useful because at the time it shows that people like Faithorne thought that Cromwell had done God's work in winning the Civil War and the results were the peace and order at his feet and his Protectorate was popular.	5-6
Level 2	Simple evaluation of source based on content and/or provenance Candidates may progress from a basic analysis of the source by reasoning supported with factual knowledge and understanding. For example, it is useful because it shows that Cromwell was held in high regard and seen as a saintly figure.	3-4

Level 1 Basic analysis of source

1-2

Answers may show understanding/support for the source, but the case is made by assertion/basic inference.

Candidates identify basic features which are valid about the source related to the enquiry point, for example, it is useful because it shows at the time they thought Cromwell had won the war he stands on the king and a snake.

Candidates either submit no evidence or fail to address the question

0

Responses

Student one

Source A is useful because it shows what some people thought of Cromwell at the time. In the source, Cromwell is shown in a good light, because he has a dove above his head and he is standing in a way that makes him look powerful. For example, the scrolls on the left of Cromwell refers to the Magna Carta which links Cromwell to a popular and celebrated event in English history that gave the people more power. Similarly, Cromwell is much taller than everyone else in the picture, and they are looking up at him in awe. However, many English people didn't support Cromwell at all because he banned Christmas and closed theatres. The source is therefore useful because it shows us that Cromwell used propaganda to persuade people that he was powerful and the rightful leader.

Commentary - Level 3

The answer develops information relating to the provenance of the source, and within the image, to argue that the artist must have been a supporter of Cromwell. It should be marked at Level 3. The answer might proceed to explore why in 1658 an image like this was needed or important to people who had supported Cromwell.

Student two

Source A is useful to a historian studying Cromwell because it shows how powerful Cromwell was. He looks heroic and has suit of armour and there are soldiers in the background. This makes Cromwell look powerful. This is useful because it shows that Cromwell was seen as a powerful man by people at the time.

Source A is also useful because there is a church on the column beside Cromwell. There is also a religious image in the top right hand corner of the picture, while light is coming from the sky and shining on Cromwell's head. This is useful because it shows how religious Cromwell was.

Commentary - Level 2

This answer is descriptive of the content. The first two sentences make inferences about the impression that Cromwell creates in the source. The second part of the answer is descriptive. This answer would be improved if the student applied some historical context based on their own knowledge to both the content of the source and its provenance.

Question 02

Explain the significance of the Magna Carta in the development of the rights of the British people.

[8 marks]

Mark scheme

Target	Explain and analyse historical events and periods studied using second-order concepts (AO2: 6) Demonstrates knowledge and understanding of the key features and characteristics of the period studied (AO1:2)	
Level 4	Complex explanation of aspects of significance Answer demonstrates specific knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question. Extends Level 3. Candidates may progress from a developed explanation of significance by explaining the relationship between aspects of significance, for example, over time, supported by factual knowledge and understanding. Such as...it was significant at the time because the barons were pleased to have obtained agreement from the king of their rights. They renewed their oaths of allegiance to him. In the long term, the idea that everyone was entitled to a fair trial and justice was significant because its principles inspired many documents such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948) and the European Convention on Human Rights (1950).	7-8
Level 3	Answer demonstrates specific knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question. Extends Level 2. Candidates may progress from a simple explanation of significance with developed reasoning considering two or more aspects of significance, supported by factual knowledge and understanding. In addition to a Level 2 response, candidates make additional developed point(s). For example, it was also significant because the Magna Carta gave all freemen in the country the right to a fair trial. This meant they could not be treated unfairly in court and could expect justice. For example, it was also significant because it meant the king had to seek advice and consent from the barons if he wanted to raise taxes, so this changed the relationship between the barons and the King, giving the barons power over the king.	5-6

Level 2	<p>Simple explanation of one aspect of significance</p> <p>Answer demonstrates specific but simple knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question.</p> <p>Candidates may progress from a basic explanation of significance by simple reasoning of one of the identified aspects, supported by factual knowledge and understanding.</p> <p>For example, the signing of the Magna Carta was significant for the nobles because it was a peace treaty between the nobles and the king and it meant that the King was also subject to the law of the land.</p>	3-4
Level 1	<p>Basic explanation of aspect(s) of significance</p> <p>Answer demonstrates basic knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question.</p> <p>Candidates identify aspect(s) of significance, which are relevant to the question. Explanation at this level is likely to be implicit or by assertion.</p> <p>For example, because it was a treaty signed by the nobles and the King that brought peace between them.</p>	1-2
	<p>Candidates either submit no evidence or fail to address the question</p>	0

Responses

Student one

The Magna Carta is significant in the development of the rights of the British people because it was the first time that the King of England agreed that he didn't have total power. For example, the barons made John swear that people had to agree to taxes before the King took taxes off people. This was significant because the King couldn't just do what he wanted anymore, he had to make sure that he had the support of his barons when it came to collecting taxes. Therefore, more British people had a say for the first time in how the country was run.

In the long term Magna Carta was significant because it helped to pave the way for democracy in Britain. Before Magna Carta, the King could do what he wanted and didn't have to ask permission from anyone. However, Magna Carta meant that the King now had to obey laws and people had greater rights. This was a long term effect of the Magna Carta, as it inspired other movements in Britain to improve rights in Britain. 'During the Middle Ages Kings repeatedly reissued Magna Carta, in 1265 Simon to Montfort confirmed Magna Carta and the Provisions of Oxford of 1258, and Levellers like John Lilburne referred to the Charter in the C17th.

Commentary – Level 3

The response shows two aspects of significance. One of which demonstrates developed reasoning and supported with relevant knowledge and understanding. It should be marked at Level 3. The other simple point about the significance at the time might have been developed to explain how the nobility rather than everyone benefited from the charter.

Student two

The Magna Carta was significant because it forced the King to obey the laws of England. King John had to sign the Magna Carta at Runnymede after the King had angered the barons taxing them without their consent so he could pay for his wars with France. They wanted to make sure that he couldn't take any more of their money. By signing the Magna Carta, John was able to make sure that the Barons didn't take his power, but now he had to obey the law. This meant that the King couldn't just do what he wanted any more.

Commentary - Level 2

This answer shows the student's own knowledge of the barons' grievances and the reasons for King John's actions. The answer considers the significance of Magna Carta at the time and the contrast with the situation previously or the nobles' expectations. To progress, the student should attempt to explain two points of significance.

Question 03

Compare the Peasants' revolt with the campaign for the People's Charter. In what ways were they similar?

Explain your answer with reference to both the Peasants' revolt and the campaign for the People's Charter.

[8 marks]

Mark scheme

Target	Explain and analyse historical events and periods studied using second-order concepts (AO2:4) Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the key features and characteristics of the period studied (AO1:4)	
Level 4	Complex explanation of similarities Answer demonstrates a range of accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question Extends Level 3. Candidates may progress from a developed explanation of similarity by explanation of the complexities of similarities arising from the broader historical context supported by factual knowledge and understanding. For example, the way both the Peasants' Revolt and the Chartist movement were inspired at root by economic conditions. Support for Chartism varied with the prosperity of the working class and the Revolt was triggered by the excessive demands of the Poll Tax placed on a population reduced by the Black Death and unimpressed by the French wars it was paying for.	7-8
Level 3	Developed explanation of similarities Answer demonstrates a range of accurate knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question Extends Level 2. Candidates may progress from a simple explanation of similarity with developed reasoning considering two or more identified similarities, supported by factual knowledge and understanding. In addition to a Level 2 response, candidates make additional developed point(s). For example, also both the Peasants' Revolt and the Chartist movement involved the ordinary working people trying to improve their lives. They aimed to get the ruling classes to concede to their demands either for more freedom or a better voice in things that affected their lives. For example...the Peasants' revolt and the Chartist movement had a strong economic element to their origin and support. The Peasants' revolt was prompted by high taxation and the Chartist movement gained and lost	5-6

support depending on the prosperity of the working class.

Level 2 Simple explanation of one similarity 3-4

Answer demonstrates specific knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question

Candidates may progress from a **basic** explanation of similarity by reasoning supported with factual knowledge and understanding, which might be related to **one** of the identified similarities.

For example, the fact that the Peasants' Revolt and the Chartist movement both failed at the time. The Peasants' Revolt was a failure as serfdom was retained. The Chartists did not achieve their goals either; men in the towns did not get the vote until 1867.

Level 1 Basic explanation of similarity/similarities 1-2

Answer demonstrates basic knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question.

Candidates identify similarity/similarities, which are relevant to the question.

Explanation at this level is likely to be implicit or by assertion.

For example, the Peasants' Revolt and the Chartist movement both involved violence.

Candidates either submit no evidence or fail to address the question 0

Responses

Student one

The Peasants' revolt and the campaign for the People's Charter both happened because of how unfair the system was. For example, the Peasants' revolt came about because in 1381 peasants in England had very little power. For example, they were when the poll tax was imposed on the people of Britain, they had no choice but to pay or be arrested. The population was already suffering from expensive wars and the Black Death, so being taxed was the last straw. The campaign for a People's Charter also aimed to give the working people of Britain more power. For example, the Chartists held mass meetings and demonstrations to protest about how unfair parliament and voting was in Britain in the 19th Century and give people a say in how decisions were made in the country.

Another similarity is that both movements took violent action against their opponents. For example, during the Peasants' Revolt, the rebels broke in to the Tower of London and killed the Archbishop of Canterbury. Similarly, in the Newport Rising twenty Chartists were shot by soldiers after they tried to free Chartist prisoners. So, in both of the events, the tactics used were sometimes violent, even though the Chartists used non-violent tactics like mass meetings more often.

Commentary – Level 3

This answer provides two points of similarity. The first is about the causes of the two events being similar because they represented a protest against unfairness in government. This was to do with the poll tax and the franchise respectively. The second point of similarity concerns the methods chosen to pursue their cause. Each point of similarity is supported by knowledge and understanding. This answer merits a Level 3 mark.

Student two

The Peasants' Revolt and the Campaign for the People's Charter were similar because they both fought for the rights of the poor. For example, during the Peasants' Revolt, Wat Tyler wanted the King to ban serfdom, which would have given peasants more freedom. Similarly, the campaign for the People's Charter aimed to give all men over 21 the vote, which would have given more people a say in how the country was run. Both of the movements failed to achieve their goals, which is another reason why they were similar.

Commentary – Level 2

This answer develops one similarity about the causes of the two events at a simple level. The second similarity about both movements failure to achieve their goals is not explained. The answer merits a Level 2 mark.

Question 04

Has religion been the main factor in causing protest in Britain since Medieval times?

Explain your answer with reference to religion and other factors.

[16 marks + 4 marks for SPAG]

Mark scheme

Target	Explain and analyse historical events and periods studied using second-order concepts (AO2:8) Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the key features and characteristics of the period studied (AO1:8)	
Level 4	Complex explanation of stated factor and other factor(s) leading to a sustained judgement Answer demonstrates a range of accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question Answer demonstrates a complex, sustained line of reasoning which has a sharply-focused coherence and logical structure that is fully substantiated, with well-judged relevance. Extends Level 3. Candidates may progress from a developed explanation of factors by analysis of the relationship between factors supported by factual knowledge and understanding. For example, Religion has been a powerful factor in causing protest at certain times in history, such as in the case of the Pilgrimage of Grace, however other factors such as political reasons in the case of the Suffragettes, who wanted the right to vote, have become the main factor in causing protest in the modern era.	13-16
Level 3	Developed explanation of the stated factor and other factor(s) Answer demonstrates a range of accurate knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question Answer demonstrates a developed, sustained line of reasoning which has coherence and logical structure; it is well substantiated, and with sustained, explicit relevance. Extends Level 2. Answers may suggest that one factor has greater merit. Candidates may progress from a simple explanation of factors with extended reasoning supported by factual knowledge and understanding.	9-12

For example, religion was an important factor in causing protest in the Pilgrimage of Grace because they were angry about Henry VIII's break with Rome and the dissolution of the monasteries. Their religion was their way to heaven, therefore it mattered a lot. Many people in the north feared that baptism would be taxed and that the break with Rome meant they would not be able to practise their faith.

The role of decisions about economics was very important in causing protest. The decision to collect a Poll tax in 1381 led to revolt and Charles I's efforts to finance government without parliament all led to protests. Even the taxes of King John contributed to Baronial discontent as King John had nothing to show for it.

Level 2 Simple explanation of the stated factor or other factor(s) 5-8

Answer demonstrates specific knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question.

Answer demonstrates a simple, sustained line of reasoning which is coherent, structured, substantiated and explicitly relevant.

Candidates may progress from a basic explanation of factors by reasoning supported with factual knowledge and understanding.

For example...economic reasons caused the Peasants revolt, and caused dissatisfaction that led to the clash of Parliament and King in the 17th century. Although this conflict also had a religious aspect with the Puritans in Parliament. Groups like the suffragettes protested for political rights. The match girls were campaigning for better working conditions.

Level 1 Basic explanation of one or more factors 1-4

Answer demonstrates basic knowledge and understanding that is relevant to the question.

Answer demonstrates a basic line of reasoning, which is coherent, structured with some substantiation; the relevance might be implicit.

Candidates recognise and provide a basic explanation which is relevant to one or more factors.

Candidates may provide a basic explanation of the stated factor. For example, religion was a factor in causing protest because one of the reasons for the Pilgrimage of Grace was the dissolution of the monasteries.

Candidates may provide a basic explanation of a different factor, such as people have also protested against unfair taxes, so economic factors can be important.

Candidates either submit no evidence or fail to address the 0

Response

Student one

Religion has been an important factor in causing protest in Britain. This is seen in the Pilgrimage of Grace, where rebels demanded that the old ways of religion in England should be restored by Henry VIII. Later events like Civil War were also linked to religion. For example, extreme Puritans rebelled against Charles I because they thought that he was a supporter of the Catholics in Britain. Religion even affected the way the armies were run in the Civil War, because while you had to be a protestant to fight in the New Model Army. This demonstrates how important religion was in causing protest, because it was one of the key reasons why the war started and led to the execution of Charles I and the end of the Divine Right of Kings.

Religion is not the only factor that caused protest in Britain since Medieval times. Money was also an important factor. One of the causes of the Peasants' revolt was the poll tax, which hurt the poor more than it hurt the rich because everyone had to pay the exact same amount in tax. Money was also a key reason why trade unions in Britain started. For example the Tolpuddle martyrs campaigned for a pay rise, and their punishment helped to inspire 800,000 people to sign a petition to release them, which was eventually successful. The Tolpuddle martyrs eventually led to the formation of other trade unions and the Labour party, who carried on protesting throughout the 20th Century.

Key individuals were also very important. For example, without Thomas Clarkson and William Wilberforce protesting in parliament and writing speeches and newspaper articles, many people would not have found out or cared about the terrible suffering caused by slavery, which helped to lead to abolition of slavery in 1807. Similarly, individuals like Emmeline Pankhurst helped to create protest for women to get the vote in the early 20th Century, through their passion, determination, and sacrifice. They disrupted meetings, smashed windows and endangered their health through hunger strikes. This drew a lot of attention to the cause of the suffragettes and helped women get the right to vote.

Overall, I don't think that religion has been the main factor. It was very important in causing protest in the middle ages and up until the English Civil War. However, other factors like money and individuals became more important later on. Overall, I think that money and standards of living was the most important factor. Money helped to inspire movements like the Chartists and Peasants' revolt, while it's also still a big reason for protest for trade unions in Britain today. 'Furthermore even those religious events like the pilgrimage of grace and the Civil War had an economic side to them. The pilgrims lost the charitable alms of the monasteries and Parliament was upset about Charles' demands for money.' Also, while key individuals were important in causing protest money and raising living standards was often the key reason for motivating the people. For instance, women's suffrage was not just because men already had the vote but because the women wanted to pass laws that would improve the rights and standards of living and working of women.

Commentary – Level 4

A very good response that shows knowledge and understanding of three factors including the one named in the question. The conclusion argues for the importance of a different factor from that which was suggested in the question which is backed up with further relevant reasoning. This answer should be marked at Level 4.

Student two

On the one hand Religion was a factor in causing protest in Britain. For example, the Pilgrimage of Grace happened a result of the changes that Henry VIII made to the church in England, like closing the monasteries and changing the religious services. People who took part in the Pilgrimage of Grace even had to take the Pilgrims oath, where they vowed to defend their faith against Henry. This shows how important religion was in causing protest in Britain.

On the other hand, there were other factors that caused protest in Britain since Medieval times. One of these factors was new ideas. For example, the Chartists and the Suffragettes both wanted to give the vote to a wider group of people in Britain. The Chartists wanted to extend the vote to all men over 21, and the Suffragettes wanted women to get the vote too. These two movements created a lot of protest in Britain. For example, the Chartists organized huge public demonstrations, while the Suffragettes used more militant tactics to achieve their goals. These new ideas led to protest in the 19th and 20th centuries in Britain.

Another factor that caused protest in Britain in was war. For example, King John was opposed by the barons because he had to tax them in order to pay for his wars with France. This made the barons protest against John and meant that he had to sign the Magna Carta.

Overall, I think that religion has been the main factor in causing protest in Britain. This is because lead to the Pilgrimage of Grace, which was a very important protest in the History of Britain. Other factors like new ideas were also important, but they were not as important as religion.

Commentary – Level 2

This answer identifies one example of a protest that was motivated for religious reasons. It shows knowledge of the event, the Pilgrimage of Grace. In the second paragraph it identifies the factor of new ideas in relation to the 19th century Chartists and the 20th century Suffragettes. Again the answer shows knowledge of the tactics of each protest. Finally there is the example of warfare causing protest in the 13th century. The conclusion to the answer is not particularly effective because it expresses an opinion about the central proposition of religion as a factor without any further decisive argument. However the answer shows simple knowledge and understanding of several factors, including that named in the question, ranging across the medieval, early modern and 19th and 20th centuries. It deserves a Level 2 mark.

Get help and support

Visit our website for information, guidance, support and resources at aqa.org.uk/8145

You can talk directly to the History subject team

E: history@aqa.org.uk

T: 0161 958 3861